

MONROE TOWN BOARD MEETING MINUTES

— 11/21/2022

MONROE TOWN BOARD MEETING AGENDA (Monday, November 21, 2022)

Generated by Valerie Bitzer

Public Hearings Transcribed by Deputy Town Clerk Barbara Singer & Town Clerk Valerie Bitzer

Members present

Supervisor -Tony Cardone, Mike McGinn, Mary Bingham, Sal Scancarello

1. Call to Order

Discussion, Information, Procedural: 1.1 Pledge to the Flag

2. Motion to Open Town Board Meeting

Action (Resolution): 2.1 Motion to Open Town Board Meeting of November 21, 2022

2022-#558

BE IT RESOLVED that the Town Board of the Town of Monroe Made a Motion to Open the Town Board Meeting of November 21, 2022 at 7:05 PM.

Motion by Sal Scancarello, second by Mary Bingham.

Final Resolution: Motion Carries

Aye: Supervisor -Tony Cardone, Mike McGinn, Mary Bingham, Sal Scancarello

3. Community Announcements

Presentations: 3.1 Harriman Army/Navy, Recognition of 50 Years of Service to the Community

To hear Supervisor Cardone, and Board Members RE Harriman Army/Navy, Recognition of 50 Years of Service to the Community, please go on-line to Board Doc's Video Clip #3.1, 0:0:56.

Information: 3.2 Orange County to Host Free Showing of "Devotion" for Veterans at Flagship Cinemas in Monroe

Orange County Executive, Steve Neuhaus and Veterans Service Agency Director, Christian Farrell will host a free showing of the soon to be released movie "Devotion" at Flagship Cinemas in Monroe on Tuesday, November 29th. Two showings of the movie will be available that day at 2 p.m. and 6 p.m. The County coordinated the event with assistance from Flagship Cinemas, Shoprite Supermarkets, Inc. and the Monroe Town Board.

Devotion, an aerial war epic based on the bestselling book of the same name, tells the

harrowing true story of two elite U.S. Navy fighter pilots during the Korean War. Their heroic sacrifices would ultimately make them the Navy's most celebrated wingmen. Veterans can reserve a spot to view Devotion on November 29th for themselves and a guest by contacting Christian Farrell at 845-291-2470 or via email at cfarrell@orangecountygov.com. Complimentary popcorn and soda will be served.

To hear Supervisor Cardone RE Orange County to Host Free Showing of "Devotion" for Veterans at Flagship Cinemas in Monroe, please go on-line to Board Doc's Video Clip #3.2, 0:9:02.

Information: 3.3 Holiday "Meet & Treat" At Town Hall

A Holiday Meet & Treat hosted by the Town of Monroe will take place on Saturday, December 3rd from 2-5 p.m. at Town Hall. Vendors, treats and a special visit from Santa & Mrs. Claus from 3-5 p.m. will all be part of the holiday fun!

To hear Councilman Scancarello RE Holiday "Meet & Treat" At Town Hall, please go on-line to Board Doc's Video Clip #3.3, 0:10:27.

Information: 3.4 Toys For Military Tots

To hear Supervisor Cardone RE Toys for Military Tots, please go on-line to Board Doc's Video Clip #3.4, 0:10:58.

Information: 3.5 Annual Frank Ferrigno Memorial Teddy Bear Drive

To hear Councilwoman Bingham, and Supervisor Cardone RE Annual Frank Ferrigno Memorial Teddy Bear Drive, please go on-line to Board Doc's Video Clip #3.5, 0:11:53.

Information: 3.6 Small Business Saturday

To hear Councilman Scancarello RE Small Business Saturday, please go on-line to Board Doc's Video Clip #3.6, 0:12:55.

4. Public Hearing

Action (Resolution), Discussion: 4.1 Motion to Adopt the 2023 Town of Monroe Budget

2022-#559

BE IT RESOLVED that the Town Board of the Town of Monroe Made a Motion to approve the 2023 Town of Monroe Town Budget.

Motion by Supervisor -Tony Cardone, second by Sal Scancarello.

Final Resolution: Motion Carries

Aye: Supervisor -Tony Cardone, Mike McGinn, Mary Bingham, Sal Scancarello

The following residents signed up to speak during Public Comment RE the Adoption of the 2023 Town of Monroe Budget. To hear their comments, and Board Members responses, please go on-line to Board Doc's Video Clip #4.1, 0:13:26.

****NO PUBLIC COMENT AT THIS TIME**

- Supervisor Cardone: Madam Clerk can we bring up that first slide with the tax summary sheet. Maybe enlarge that a little? And I know it might be hard for folks. Up top, isn't that little microphone, a magnifying glass not a microphone. Just click on the plus up there Brian. Yeah, right there, here we go. That works a little better. Okay so this year we had a lot of challenges with respect to expenses and the uptick in that along with the rise in our benefit costs, workman's comp and it was a real challenge to get to where we are. Roberta, Helen and Jen they really worked hard at this. Roberta and Helen especially. there were a few nights we stayed a little late to try to tweak things a little bit. So, the actual tax levy was \$3,771,248. Essentially what it comes down to is we were able to accomplish this two ways. Number one by cutting expenses, number two by trying to increase some revenues and number three, I should say not two ways three ways, but we had to contribute a little more this year in the from the fund balance. I think it was about \$225,000 more this year than we did in the past and it's a little troubling. I guess to have to do that but in order to stay below the cap that was really the main avenue that helped get us there. So, we're under the cap, if you go down second to last

Row of boxes we're under the cap by \$7907 and it's always good to have a little buffer there. You actually benefit from that next year. Although not greatly but you will benefit from that but if there are some outstanding things that pop up even though we have some dollars in contingency, it does give us a little more of a buffer. Now the levy was 3.87% over last year's levy but that is attributed to the fact that we receive multiple increases based on what we had left over, sales tax, what else Roberta?

- Roberta McBride: The pilots.

- Supervisor Cardone: Right, pilots. So that said bottom line is on a home. So, if you go to the next slide on a hundred-thousand-dollar home in the village, you're looking at a 0.87% increase from last year to this year. I'll hold up till we get that slide up there. So, you're basically looking at from 22 to 23 on a hundred thousand dollar assessed value home you're going from 702.74 in the village to 708.64. And in the town, you're going from \$1040.52 to 1143.84. These are round numbers because we only went out two digits. Traditionally we go out six, so there's going to be a little bit of a difference there in some change but for the most part that's it. Now if you look at the history you know this Town Board has been very diligent in in managing the budget. So, from 2019 we've had in a decrease in the village taxes just over 11% and in 2019 through 2023 a town home was just short of an 8% decrease over those five years. So, I don't think there's much more this Board or our finance department could have done with this and next year is going to be extremely challenging with the anticipated increases that we're seeing going forward. Anybody on the board have any questions?

- Councilwoman Bingham: Just want to make a comment that it's nice to see from 2019 to 2023 the homeowners are actually paying less. Most people think their taxes keep going up, up, up but that's a that's a nice little savings you know and put a tank of gas in your car.

- Supervisor Cardone: Yeah, and I think one thing that you know we have to remember is that these are just our town taxes. This has nothing to do with school, it's got nothing to do with the county. This is just your town tax bill, so we don't have control over those. That's essentially done by the respective districts and the county, so I just wanted to read Councilwoman Houle, who could not be here this evening, and I do have an email that I wanted to read from her. Just give me a second, okay? Good evening, Supervisor Cardone and the Town Board please accept my apologies for not attending tonight's Board meeting. My family and I are spending the Thanksgiving holiday with family in Palm Coast Florida. Our thoughts and prayers are with the family whose home was damaged by a fire. I am sure our community will come together to make sure their needs are met. I have read through the budget and while I cannot vote to approve it due to my absence, I would like to express my approval and satisfaction with the fiscal conservatism and responsibility that was used to create a budget that protects our residents. I'd also like to welcome our newest Ethics Board members Jack Collins and Larry Lizak, thank you for volunteering. They'll be approved later in the meeting.

There is so much for each of us to be thankful for and I wish the Board and our residents a Happy Thanksgiving. Best regards, Dory Houle. So, that said Dory did want to call in tonight but under the guidelines that have been lifted where we were able to do that in the past, she would have not been able to vote she would just have been able to listen. She couldn't have commented either so that said, Roberta anything you wanted to add with respect to the budget? No? All right. Do you have a percentage of what our benefits in totality went up approximately? Was it like?

- Roberta McBride: I don't have an actual number from the state for the health insurance which is our biggest benefit cost. We're calculating a seven percent increase. Could be less, probably will be more.

- Supervisor Cardone: Alright, no that's fine and that's what the contingency lines are for to help offset that if it's more than seven percent.

- Roberta McBride: So, a lot more but yeah plus until.

- Supervisor Cardone: Okay all right thank you. I will make a motion to approve the 2023 Town of Monroe budget. Do I have a second?

- Councilman Scancarello: Second.

- Supervisor Cardone: Any other discussion? Call to question.

- Councilwoman Bingham: Bingham, aye.

- Supervisor Cardone: Cardone, aye.

- Councilman Scancarello: Scancarello, aye.

- Councilman McGinn: McGinn, aye.

- Supervisor Cardone: Okay so moved.

- Councilman McGinn: Yeah, just congratulations and thank you for the hard work you and the financial office, Roberta, Helen, everyone that put into getting this, getting us to this point and keeping us under the cap. Good work by everybody.
- Supervisor Cardone: Thank you Mike. Roberta, that means you can leave now you don't have to stay. And listen there was a lot of assistance that came from our department heads and all of our departments that helped us get to that point as well understanding the difficulties we were in with this economy.

Action (Resolution), Discussion: 4.2 Motion to Open the Continuation of Public Hearing RE: Amendments to Local Law No. 1/2022, Short-Term Rentals

2022-#560

BE IT RESOLVED that the Town Board of the Town of Monroe Made a Motion to Open the Continuation of the Public Hearing RE: Amendments to Local Law #1 of 2022, Short-Term Rentals.

Motion by Supervisor -Tony Cardone, second by Mary Bingham.

Final Resolution: Motion Carries

Aye: Supervisor -Tony Cardone, Mike McGinn, Mary Bingham, Sal Scancarello

The following residents signed up to speak during the Continuation of Public Hearing RE: Amendments to Local Law No. 1/2022, Short-Term Rentals. To hear their comments, and Board Members responses, please go on-line to Board Doc's Video Clip #4.2, 0:24:08.

- Suzanne Gowan

- Town Clerk Valerie Bitzer: I do have Public Comment when you're ready.
- Supervisor Cardone: What's that?
- Town Clerk Valerie Bitzer: I do have Public Comment when you're ready.
- Supervisor Cardone: Okay. Go head.
- Town Clerk Valerie Bitzer: Suzanne Gowan.
- Suzanne Gowan: Hi. (Inaudible).
- Supervisor Cardone: For the record just state your name and your address.
- Suzanne Gowan: Suzanne Gowan, Ludlam Road, Monroe, New York.
- Supervisor Cardone: Thank you.
- Suzanne Gowan: Just a question regarding this. I just wanna, I tried to read through it, and I'm not, it's not easy reading for me cause I just feel like it's all legal. Some of it's all legal. But question, what I did read it seems like there would be a lot of oversight needed. So, my

question is, if this happens how do we enforce this?

- Supervisor Cardone: So, number one, it did happen. We're just making changes to it.

- Suzanne Gowan: Okay.

- Supervisor Cardone: And number two, we did include in this year's Budget a Code Enforcement Officer who will be essentially dedicated to this, and anything else we choose to (inaudible).

- Suzanne Gowan: So, it doesn't necessarily fall on the hands of the Building Inspector?

- Supervisor Cardone: Well, it will fall in the Building Department, but not necessarily in his hands directly.

- Suzanne Gowan: Okay. And just (inaudible) does the Town need to (inaudible) or people that will help enforce rules, and regulations? Cause you definitely have your hands full.

- Supervisor Cardone: When, when you mean contribute more do, (inaudible) do you mean budget more?

- Suzanne Gowan: No, to you know, people that would go out to because I'm not quite sure how you enforce these rules or regulations. How do you see that people are doing what they should be doing? I'm not even sure what this is, if you could kind of in a nutshell tell us exactly what this is I would appreciate it.

- Supervisor Cardone: I mean it's a short-term rental agreement which encompasses those people. Real quickly, that advertise on Airbnb, VRBO or any other site associated with short-term rentals. Anything less than 30 days I think we have in here, and essentially what, what happens with it is it's gonna be the neighbors that are gonna assist and help us in enforcing it.

- Suzanne Gowan: So, basically if I want to rent, if I rent my (inaudible) summer (inaudible) not gonna necessarily be out advertising, (inaudible) by word of (inaudible). I don't mean to be argumentative (inaudible) or something like (inaudible). How would you know?

- Councilman McGinn: I mean listen; I could probably address some of that Suzanne.

- Suzanne Gowan: Okay.

- Councilman McGinn: I mean listen, obviously every law that's made there's a loophole around.

- Suzanne Gowan: Right. Right.

Councilman McGinn: Or you can get you can try to get around it.

- Suzanne Gowan: Right.

- Councilman McGinn: By basically breaking it. We feel confident by having the Code Inspector, Code Enforcement Officer added to, added to our, cadre.

- Suzanne Gowan: Right.

- Councilman McGinn: Building Department, neighbors, you know obviously. Listen, the whole idea of this whole law was to, to regulate those short-term rentals. You know, Airbnb's, you know, VRBO, whatever, or people doing it on their own so that (a) they would have to register with the town first. Right. Once they registered with the town, they would have to comply with certain, you know, certain standards that they would have to have, and then once that's done then it's a matter of our Code Enforcement person whether it's through personal observation,

(inaudible) complaints or whatever. Now that all being said by and large most of the Airbnb people and VRBO people they, they do comply with it. Right? You know it's other people that kind of go outside that realm that do it, but whether you're part of those organizations or not you still have to register with the town. So, the first thing is if you're not registered with the town and you're, you're engaged ya know, doing these short-term rentals, well you're already you know that's one strike against you. Right? And you know there's just like any type of enforcement action the town takes, ya know, civil enforcement action of course with these you know there's fines, there's court, there's all those things. Listen this all came to our attention and correct me if I'm wrong Tony, is, is people complaining about these, these, these residences that would have a bachelor party or a group of young men come up and engage in a focus party.

- Suzanne Gowan: (Inaudible) and I, (inaudible), I can appreciate that cause I, when a law or what amendments or whatever are put in the question behind it is usually like why did it come about? So, that's how let's say it comes about by people complaining and then laws are enacted, or codes are changed. So, I, I can appreciate that.

- Supervisor Cardone: And, and just so you know, in the infancy stages of this.

- Suzanne Gowan: Yeah.

- Supervisor Cardone: Pretty much everyone on this Town Board was totally against short-term rentals. We were leaning towards not having any short-term rentals, and what happened was, we had a group come in, they were already renting. They expressed their positives of what it brings to the town as far as an economic influx, and the fact that more people are coming up and visiting our town. They actually kinda formed a quasi-committee. We worked with them. Councilman McGinn, and myself and we came up with an alternative to it. So.

- Suzanne Gowan: (Inaudible). I'm just aware, now that I come to more Town meetings which is, (inaudible) it's important, but I would think how would anybody know about these laws? I wouldn't think twice about it. I mean I don't think I would know this unless I'm here reading this. So, how do people find out about that? I mean like.

- Supervisor Cardone: Go, go on the website.

- Suzanne Gowan: No, I know but I'm saying people don't go on the website. This room as far as I'm concerned, this room should, should be packed. I would like it to be packed. I shouldn't say it should be packed. I would very much like this room to be packed at every Town Board meeting. I don't want to be coming to all these Town Board meetings. I understand people have (inaudible).

- Supervisor Cardone: What is, listen, I mean we're going back and forth which we traditionally don't do during public hearings, but I will, I will, what is your, what is your idea as to what you.

- Suzanne Gowan: I don't know. When something like this is going on (inaudible) another way of saying you need like a newsletter or something. You know in the Photo News like something that's just printed.

- Supervisor Cardone: So, so we have our monthly update where we list some of the new things that have happened.

- Suzanne Gowan: On the website?
- Supervisor Cardone: No, it's not on our website. It's, it's an, it's an email. It's called Constant Contact. Anybody, anybody in this room should sign up for it. I mean, there, there's.
- Suzanne Gowan: But there's nobody in this room at the moment.
- (Inaudible)
- Supervisor Cardone: It doesn't matter if they're in this room or if they're not in this room.
- (Inaudible).
- Supervisor Cardone: Anybody in the town can sign up for it.
- Suzanne Gowan: Okay.
- Supervisor Cardone: If you live in Chester, we welcome you to sign up for it. So, you could find out the happenings so we could promote what's going on in Monroe.
- Suzanne Gowan: (Inaudible). And just one other thing, talk about suggestions, maybe channel, is it 22?
- Supervisor Cardone: Mmm, hmm.
- Suzanne Gowan: (Inaudible) when people watch the meetings. It actually, if you were on or anybody was on and kind of just did a little you know comment, comment then. This is what we discussed. This is what we're gonna be discussing. That would be helpful. And I'm not, I'm not, I do not envy you. I just can't imagine anybody getting involved in this. I think you're doing the best you can. I'd like to believe you're doing the best you can. So, I don't mean to sound critical, but I just, that's kinda my.
- Supervisor Cardone: Okay.
- Suzanne Gowan: I don't know how to kinda put my input without that. But that would be a suggestion.
- Supervisor Cardone: All right. Sounds good.
- Councilman McGinn: And honestly, we do go through lengths to, to publicize these. Whether they're through mailings. Whether it's on the website. Whether it's through Constant Contact, we have now a Facebook page that, that will have that information. But at the end of the day, listen, this (inaudible) has to be involved.
- Suzanne Gowan: I know. (Inaudible). I agree. I agree. I agree.
- Councilman McGinn: And, and listen, you know that's. We can't go home and.
- Suzanne Gowan: I know.
- Councilman McGinn: Get the phone out of their hands and say, "Hey stop, get off Tick Tock, and come to the Town Board meeting.
- Suzanne Gowan: No, I agree.
- Councilman McGinn: You've gotta take a personal responsibility.
- Suzanne Gowan: Right. I agree. I agree.
- Councilman McGinn: Like you're doing, and your husband's doing right now.
- Suzanne Gowan: I agree. (Inaudible).
- Councilman McGinn: And say hey, I gotta, this is my Town. This is my Village. This is my state.

- Suzanne Gowan: Right.
- Councilman McGinn: Country and do it. And, but we, we do try.
- Suzanne Gowan: (Inaudible).
- Councilman McGinn: And Channel 22 is a good thing.
- Suzanne Gowan: (Inaudible).
- Councilman McGinn: They don't get the.
- Supervisor Cardone: Not everybody gets Channel 22.
- Councilman McGinn: Yeah. Because they don't have cable.
- Suzanne Gowan: Okay. There you go. Ya know. Okay.
- Councilman Scancarello: Constant Contact is, is excellent as well. I mean that's.
- Councilman McGinn: Yeah.
- Suzanne Gowan: Okay. And by, okay so, if not, everybody gets channel 22 this conversation is going nowhere, because then people don't hear it. But that's, that's.
- Supervisor Cardone: Oh no.
- (Inaudible)
- (Laughter)
- Supervisor Cardone: No. No. (Inaudible) That's, I was just clarifying the fact that it's not like channel 22 is in everybody's house.
- Suzanne Gowan: Right.
- Supervisor Cardone: Somebody might not have a computer and not have access to Constant Contact.
- Suzanne Gowan: Right, but I would like to think that people that aren't Town Board meetings, some of them probably are watching the TV. And again, I appreciate this time. I didn't mean to do this. I just thought.
- Supervisor Cardone: No, that's fine.
- Councilman McGinn: No worries.
- Suzanne Gowan: Alright, now I'm here. Now I'm gonna try to be involved more. So.
- Supervisor Cardone: That's fine. You've gotta remember too, the biggest comment I've gotten on Channel 22 from six years ago was, your meetings are boring now. So.
- Suzanne Gowan: Oh. Oh. Thank God.
- Supervisor Cardone: Yeah exactly.
- (Laughter)
- Suzanne Gowan: Alright. Alright. Well.
- Supervisor Cardone: Exactly. Alright. Thank you, Susan.
- Councilman McGinn: Thank you.
- Supervisor Cardone: Have a Happy Thanksgiving.
- Suzanne Gowan: Thank you. You too.
- Councilman Scancarello: Bye, bye.
- Supervisor Cardone: Thank you.
- (Inaudible)

- Councilman McGinn: On the short-term rentals?
- (Inaudible)
- Councilman McGinn: All right well during Public Comment you can come up and discuss it. If it's not about the short, this is the Public Hearing on the short-term rentals.
- Supervisor Cardone: Okay. Anybody else have any comments on the Board? No? What's the Board's flavor with regard to this?
- Councilman McGinn: I mean, listen, we've had it. The changes have been made. The law has already passed. I mean I think if we're ready to adopt we could certainly move forward with it.
- Supervisor Cardone: All right so then, so then do you want to close it?

Action (Resolution): 4.3 Motion to Close the Continuation of the Public Hearing RE: Amendments to Local Law No. 1/2022, Short-Term Rentals

2022-#561

BE IT RESOLVED that the Town Board of the Town of Monroe Made a Motion to Close the Continuation of the Public Hearing RE: Amendments to Local Law #1 of 2022, Short-Term Rentals.

Motion by Mike McGinn, second by Sal Scancarello.

Final Resolution: Motion Carries

Aye: Supervisor -Tony Cardone, Mike McGinn, Mary Bingham, Sal Scancarello

Action (Resolution): 4.4 Motion to Open the Continuation of the Public Hearing in Relation to the Increase and Improvement of Facilities of the Water District No. 14

2022-#562

BE IT RESOLVED that the Town Board of the Town of Monroe Made a Motion to Open Continuation of the Public Hearing in Relation to the Increase and Improvement of Facilities of the Water District No. 14.

Motion by Supervisor -Tony Cardone, second by Mary Bingham.

Final Resolution: Motion Carries

Aye: Supervisor -Tony Cardone, Mike McGinn, Mary Bingham, Sal Scancarello

The following signed up to speak during Public Comment regarding the Continuation of the Public Hearing in Relation to the Increase and Improvement of Facilities of the Water District No. 14. To hear their comments, and Board Members responses, please go on-line to Board Docs Video Clip #4.4, 0:35:30.

****NO PUBLIC COMMENT AT THIS TIME**

- Town Clerk Valerie Bitzer: No Public Comment.
- Supervisor Cardone: Any update Mary?
- Councilwoman Bingham: Still have not heard anything from Dave Jenkins. So.
- Supervisor Cardone: So, here's what I'm gonna tell ya. We did not get any of the WIAA grants we applied for. I found out on Friday, and I was just as disgusted as we always have been. So. I don't know where, where you wanna go from here other than reapplying once again. The comment was that we had good aspects of it. There was nothing lacking, but the score wasn't high enough. I'm still waiting to get debriefed by Dave on all three. 14, Arrow Park and 10? 8. 8.
- Councilwoman Bingham: Well, I, I think it would be nice if you could reach out to the residents who were very interested in forming this water district, and kinda get their opinions before we decide if we're gonna pursue it again or keep the public comments. Keep it open for another month so they have a chance to at least respond.

Action (Resolution): 4.5 Motion to Keep Open the Continuation of the Public Hearing in Relation to the Increase and Improvement of Facilities of the Water District No. 14

2022-#563

BE IT RESOLVED that the Town Board of the Town of Monroe Made a Motion to Keep Open the Continuation of the Public Hearing in Relation to the Increase and Improvement of Facilities of the Water District No. 14 until January 9, 2023, at 7:00 PM or soon there-after.

Motion by Supervisor -Tony Cardone, second by Mike McGinn.

Final Resolution: Motion Carries

Aye: Supervisor -Tony Cardone, Mike McGinn, Mary Bingham, Sal Scancarello

Action (Resolution), Discussion: 4.6 Motion to Open the Continuation of the Public Hearing to Consider the Adoption of Local Law A-V1 2022 to Amend Ch. 57 (Zoning) Concerning the Heavy Industry Zone (Proposed Amendments to the HI Zone)

2022-#564

BE IT RESOLVED that the Town Board of the Town of Monroe Made a Motion to Open the Continuation of the Public Hearing to Consider the Adoption of Local Law A-V1 2022 to Amend Ch. 57 (Zoning) Concerning the Heavy Industry Zone (Proposed Amendments to the HI Zone).

Motion by Supervisor -Tony Cardone, second by Sal Scancarello.

Final Resolution: Motion Carries

Aye: Supervisor -Tony Cardone, Mike McGinn, Mary Bingham, Sal Scancarello

The following signed up to speak during Public Comment for the Continuation of the Public Hearing to Consider the Adoption of Local Law A-V1 2022 to Amend Ch. 57 (Zoning) Concerning the Heavy Industry Zone (Proposed Amendments to the HI Zone). To hear their comments, and Board Members responses, please go on-line to Board Docs Video Clip #4.6, 0:38:05.

****NO PUBLIC COMMENT AT THIS TIME**

- Town Clerk Valerie Bitzer: No Public Comment.
- Supervisor Cardone: Anybody on the Board wanna comment?
- Councilwoman Bingham: I know we got a letter from the county saying that basically it's.
- Supervisor Cardone: Local Determination.
- Councilwoman Bingham: Local Determination. But they just wanted to be sure that the storm water runoff was on that property as much as possible. So, I don't know if we have to do anything else with this. Mr. Nugent it was the SEQRA that we needed to coordinate? Was it a segmental?
- Town Counsel Nugent: (Inaudible)
- Supervisor Cardone: Can't hear ya.
- Town Counsel Nugent: I think it's good to go. It was done.
- Councilwoman Bingham: So, if it's done then can, well.
- Town Counsel Nugent: I would suggest closing it, and it we'll adopt at the next one.
- Supervisor Cardone: Okay.
- Councilwoman McGinn: Wanna make that motion, Mary?
- Councilwoman Bingham: Well, just, we don't have any Public Comments

Action (Resolution): 4.7 Motion to Close the Continuation of the Public Hearing A-V1 2022 to Consider the Adoption of Local Law to Amend Ch. 57 (Zoning) Concerning the Heavy Industry Zone (Proposed Amendments to the HI Zone)

2022-#565

BE IT RESOLVED that the Town Board of the Town of Monroe Made a Motion to Close the Continuation of the Public Hearing A-V1 2022 to Consider the Adoption of Local Law to Amend Ch. 57 (Zoning) Concerning the Heavy Industry Zone (Proposed Amendments to the HI Zone)

Motion by Mary Bingham, second by Mike McGinn.

Final Resolution: Motion Carries

Aye: Supervisor -Tony Cardone, Mike McGinn, Mary Bingham, Sal Scancarello

Action (Resolution), Discussion, Information: 4.8 Motion to Open the Continuation of the Public Hearing to Consider the Adoption of Local Law F-V1 2022 to Establish a Registry of all Rental Properties in the Town

2022-#566

BE IT RESOLVED that the Town Board of the Town of Monroe Made a Motion to Open the Public Hearing to Consider the Adoption of Local Law F-V1 2022 to Establish a Registry of all Rental Properties in the Town.

Motion by Supervisor -Tony Cardone second by Sal Scancarello.

Final Resolution: Motion Carries

Aye: Supervisor -Tony Cardone Mike McGinn Mary Bingham Sal Scancarello

The following residents signed up to speak regarding the Public Hearing to Consider the Adoption of Local Law F-V1 2022 to Establish a Registry of all Rental Properties in the Town. To hear their comments and Board Members responses please go on-line to Board Doc's Video Clip #4.8 0:39:49.

****NO PUBLIC COMMENT AT THIS TIME**

- Town Clerk Valerie Bitzer: No Public Comment.
- Supervisor Cardone: No Public Comment. So I know we've I believe we're still waiting for a response from the planner Counsel?
- Town Counsel Nugent: (Inaudible). We're still waiting for some documents from the Town Planner.

Action (Resolution): 4.9 Possible Motion to Keep Open the Continuation of the Public Hearing to Consider the Adoption of Local Law F-V2 2022 to Establish a Registry of all Rental Properties in the Town

2022-#567

BE IT RESOLVED that the Town Board of the Town of Monroe Made a Motion to Keep Open the Public Hearing to Consider the Adoption of Local Law F-V1 2022 to Establish a Registry of all Rental Properties in the Town until January 92023 at 7:00 PM or soon there-after.

Motion by Supervisor -Tony Cardone second by Mike McGinn.

Final Resolution: Motion Carries

Aye: Supervisor -Tony Cardone Mike McGinn Mary Bingham Sal Scancarello

Action (Resolution): 4.10 Motion to Open the Continuation of the Public Hearing Regarding Proposed Amendments to Local Law E-V1 2021 Amending Chapter 57 (ZONING) to establish a Two-Family Dwelling Overlay for the area of the Town of Monroe North of Route 17 (210812)

2022-#568

BE IT RESOLVED that the Town Board of the Town of Monroe Made a Motion to Open the Continuation of the Public Hearing Regarding Proposed Amendments to A Local Law E-V1 2021 Amending Chapter 57 (Zoning) to establish a Two-Family Dwelling Overlay for the area of the Town of Monroe North of Route 17 (210812).

Motion by Supervisor -Tony Cardone second by Mike McGinn.

Final Resolution: Motion Carries

Aye: Supervisor -Tony Cardone Mike McGinn Mary Bingham Sal Scancarello

The following signed up to speak during Public Comment for the Continuation of the Public Hearing Regarding Proposed Amendments to Local Law E-V1 2021 Amending Chapter 57 (ZONING) to establish a Two-Family Dwelling Overlay for the area of the Town of Monroe North of Route 17 (210812). To hear their comments and Town Board responses please go on-line to Board Docs Video Clip #4.10 0:40:54.

****NO PUBLIC COMMENT AT THIS TIME**

- Town Clerk Valerie Bitzer: No Public Comment.
- Supervisor Cardone: No Public Comment.
- Councilman McGinn: I think I think that I know that we got it back from the County. I think it's just a matter of maybe get the Planning Board and the Planning Board and the Building Inspector just to take one more look at since it's come back from the County and they agree with it and it's all fine and good then I think we can probably look to adopt that in January 9th as well.
- Supervisor Cardone: Okay one question that was posed Counsel if you could just clarify. So I I know we were talking about the two-family dwelling overlay for the area north of Route 17M. Does does this would this include any areas within the Moodna District?
- Town Counsel Nugent: I don't know if it it would be included. I know there was a comment from the County if if it was affected but I don't know. Because it's an overlay. So.
- Supervisor Cardone: (Inaudible)
- Town Counsel Nugent: It depends on where it lands. I don't know if you have any locations north of 17 that would be Moodna. If not then the answer's no. But I just don't know.
- Supervisor Cardone: No. No. There's nothing north that would be Moodna.
- Councilman McGinn: Yeah I don't believe anything's Moodna. I think it's all it would be all Orange County Sewer District number one. If if they.
- Supervisor Cardone: Okay.

- Councilman McGinn: Put the infrastructure in which is why we're doing this.
- Town Counsel Nugent: Yeah so you can either there's no need to override the comment cause it doesn't apply. So you can just accept the comment because it's never gonna come to fruition anyway with respect to the wastewater treatment plant and the comment regarding Moodna. There are no parcels. So the only comment from the County concerns if it was in the Moodna District that you established that there's capacity.
- Supervisor Cardone: Right.
- Town Counsel Nugent: On a parcel.
- Supervisor Cardone: There isn't right now. All right what's the I guess we're gonna have to keep this open then.
- Councilwoman Bingham: Well can we close it and just leave it open for written comments if we're just wanna wait for the Building Inspector and I guess Chairwoman Franson? Is that who you wanted Mr. McGinn?
- Councilman McGinn: Yeah we wanna keep it open for another 10 days? I just I mean listen it hasn't changed dramatically. I believe the Building Inspector and Planning Board already weighed in on this. I just wanna I'm not like 100% sure on that. I just wanna make sure that they have weighed in on it. Do you (inaudible) remember off the top of your head whether they. I'm pretty sure they did. I remember gettin comments.
- Councilwoman Bingham: I'm pretty sure the Building Inspector did; I don't necessarily remember what the Planning Board Chair.
- Councilman McGinn: Yeah.
- Councilwoman Bingham: Did. So how about we keep it open for another month and then we can always close it out in December? If we schedule it.
- Councilman McGinn: Yeah. That's what I was thinking. That we would just get that and then get the law into final form and then.
- Supervisor Cardone: You say you say keep it open for another month?
- Councilwoman Bingham: Well since.
- Supervisor Cardone: Or next meeting?
- Councilwoman Bingham: Next meeting is we only have one meeting December.
- Supervisor Cardone: December 5th. Yeah. Okay.
- Councilwoman Bingham: Yeah.

Action (Resolution): 4.11 Motion to Keep Open the Continuation of the Public Hearing Regarding Proposed Amendments to Local Law E-V1 2021 Amending Chapter 57 (Zoning) to establish a Two-Family Dwelling Overlay for the area of the Town of Monroe North of Route 17 (210812)

2022-#569

BE IT RESOLVED that the Town Board of the Town of Monroe Made a Motion to Keep Open the Continuation of the Public Hearing Regarding Proposed Amendments to A Local Law E-V1 2021 Amending Chapter 57 (Zoning) to establish a Two-Family Dwelling Overlay for the area of the Town of Monroe North of Route 17 (210812) until December 52022 at 7:00 PM or soon there-after.

Motion by Supervisor -Tony Cardone second by Mike McGinn.

Final Resolution: Motion Carries

Aye: Supervisor -Tony Cardone Mike McGinn Mary Bingham Sal Scancarello

Action (Resolution) Discussion: 4.12 Motion to Open the Continuation of the Public Hearing RE: Local Law H-V1 of 2022 to Amend Chapter 57 (Zoning) Concerning the Regulations Governing Tree Preservation

2022-#570

BE IT RESOLVED that the Town Board of the Town of Monroe Made a Motion to Open the Continuation of the Public Hearing RE: Local Law H-V1 of 2022 to Amend Chapter 57 (Zoning) Concerning the Regulations Governing Tree Preservation.

Motion by Supervisor -Tony Cardone second by Sal Scancarello.

Final Resolution: Motion Carries

Aye: Supervisor -Tony Cardone Mike McGinn Mary Bingham Sal Scancarello

The following residents signed up to speak during Public Comment for the continuation of the Public Hearing RE: Local Law H-V1 of 2022 to Amend Chapter 57 (Zoning) Concerning the Regulations Governing Tree Preservation. To hear their comments and Board Members responses please go on-line to Board Doc's Video Clip #4.12 0:44:45.

- Maureen Richardson

- Supervisor Cardone: So we're awaiting a final review from the planner on this as well. I know that he had sent some initial comments a couple of weeks ago.

- Town Counsel Nugent: That's correct and the county comments came around the time of the last meeting and it was recommended as a matter of local determination. Once we have Max's comments I think we'll be good to move forward.

- Supervisor Cardone: Okay.

- Councilwoman Bingham: And I think Max was waiting for the Conservation Commission.

- Supervisor Cardone: Did anybody sign up Val?

- Town Clerk Valerie Bitzer: I have one comment.

- Supervisor Cardone: Come on up.

- Maureen Richardson: So a lot of my comments.

- Supervisor Cardone: Name address.
- Maureen Richardson: Sorry my name is Maureen Richardson I'm a citizen of Monroe. I don't have to give my specific address do I?
- Supervisor Cardone: I could just give the road.
- Maureen Richardson: Harriman Heights. Basically there's a couple different issues on the table when it comes to tree preservation. Where I know you guys have heard from another resident on Hala Drive who has an interesting situation with 40 acres being completely wooded and Preserve Monroe basically had the opportunity to tour that property and it was really interesting because he invited out I think it was someone from SUNY ESF for someone from Cornell forestry and we walked the property basically with a volunteer arborist who gives recommendations on what they believe are the best practices and I'm sure that you guys got the specifics from Keith and I'm sure we'll send more specifics by email. Excuse me but the overall sentiment was interesting basically Monroe way back when was all clear-cut made into farms like it was not left as wilderness and we are in some type of cessational forest that's like a secondary or tertiary stage of like it was clear-cut and then it was not properly managed so now it is growing back . And it's growing back with a lot of invasive species or a lot of bug-infested species and certain types of trees that have seed based like repopulation like Oak or nut based population like Oak and Hickory and Walnut are having a hard time in this sort of unmanaged forest that's grown back like man tampered with it and then didn't provide a helping hand to make it grow back the way that nature sort of intended so we intervened and then we left it to sort of grow out of control and the comment from the arborist was essentially or the forester sorry was essentially that to clear-cut and intervene too much is evil but then to leave it be the way that it is to do nothing it can also be evil. And I know that it's a really difficult thing when people think that they are conserving by just having these extremely strict forestry laws and extremely financially sort of restrictive forestry laws but I guess it's a completely different part of the code that we really need to examine when it comes to tree preservation of how to balance the fact that we want to keep our oxygen creating life right like trees and the nature and the forestry that we have here but while also doing the best practices as recommended by you know scientists specialists and experts. That would be you know clear-cutting some of the dead some of the disease some of the less healthy specimens away from the more healthy specimen so that they don't starve out sunlight they don't make it completely shaded they allow natural like shrubbery and the natural biome that's supposed to exist underneath to thrive because if you create this sort of invasive issue you can starve out the intentionally like the good the beneficial from thriving. So we're not getting a balance of Hickory and Oaks as much as we should be in Monroe and we've been toying around with an idea of maybe creating like a forestry overlay for some places that they can prove that they have the best intentions and that it's specifically required instead of having like really punitive fees that I know Keith probably mentioned so just something like that so we were toying around with that idea we wanted to put that out there. That's basically it. Thank you.
- Supervisor Cardone: Thank you. That's all? Ok. Anybody on the Board want to comment?

Action (Resolution): 4.13 Motion to Keep Open the Continuation of the Public Hearing RE: Local Law H-V1 of 2022 to Amend Chapter 57 (Zoning) Concerning the Regulations Governing Tree Preservation

2022-#571

BE IT RESOLVED that the Town Board of the Town of Monroe Made a Motion to Keep Open the Continuation of the Public Hearing RE: Local Law H-V1 of 2022 to Amend Chapter 57 (Zoning) Concerning the Regulations Governing Tree Preservation until January 9 2023 at 7:00 PM or soon there-after.

Motion by Supervisor -Tony Cardone second by Mike McGinn.

Final Resolution: Motion Carries

Aye: Supervisor -Tony Cardone Mike McGinn Mary Bingham Sal Scancarello

Action (Resolution) Discussion: 4.14 Set Public Hearing Date: Amendments to Local Law Chapter 23 of the Town Code (Building Construction Administration)

2022-#572

BE IT RESOLVED that the Town Board of the Town of Monroe Made a Motion to Set a Public Hearing Date RE Amendments to Local Law Chapter 23 of the Town Code (Building Construction Administration) for January 9 2023.

Motion by Supervisor -Tony Cardone second by Mary Bingham.

Final Resolution: Motion Carries

Aye: Supervisor -Tony Cardone Mike McGinn Mary Bingham Sal Scancarello

To hear Board Members and Town Clerk Valeri Bitzer RE setting Public Hearing Date: Amendments to Local Law Chapter 23 of the Town Code (Building Construction Administration) please go on-line to Board Doc's Video Clip #4.14 0:51:00.

5. Acceptance of Minutes

Information: 5.1 Transcription of 10-17-2022 Public Hearings

**Still waiting on transcription from Stenographer. Minutes were previously approved.

Action (Resolution): 5.2 Acceptance of November 9 2022 Minutes

2022-#573

BE IT RESOLVED that the Town Board of the Town of Monroe Made a Motion to accept the November 9 2022 Minutes.

Motion by Mike McGinn second by Sal Scancarello.

Final Resolution: Motion Carries

Aye: Supervisor -Tony Cardone Mike McGinn Mary Bingham Sal Scancarello

6. Audit of Claims

Action (Resolution): 6.1 General Fund Abstract

2022-#574

BE IT RESOLVED that the Town Board of the Town of Monroe requests approval of Abstract #22-18 General Fund containing Check #29409 - 29460 totaling \$695639.19.

Motion by Supervisor -Tony Cardone second by Sal Scancarello.

Final Resolution: Motion Carries

Aye: Supervisor -Tony Cardone Mike McGinn Mary Bingham Sal Scancarello

Action (Resolution) Discussion: 6.2 Escrow Fund Abstract

2022-#575

BE IT RESOLVED that the Town Board of the Town of Monroe requests approval of Abstract #22-10 Escrow containing Check #2057 - 2061 totaling \$41459.77.

Motion by Supervisor -Tony Cardone second by Mary Bingham.

Final Resolution: Motion Carries

Aye: Supervisor -Tony Cardone Mike McGinn Mary Bingham Sal Scancarello

7. New Business

Action (Resolution) Discussion: 7.1 Board of Ethics Appointments

2022-#576

BE IT RESOLVED that the Town Board of the Town of Monroe appoints Jack Collins to the Board of Ethics SLOT #3 with an expiration of 12/31/2023.

Motion by Supervisor -Tony Cardone second by Mike McGinn.

Final Resolution: Motion Carries

Aye: Supervisor -Tony Cardone Mike McGinn Mary Bingham Sal Scancarello

2022-#577

BE IT RESOLVED that the Town Board of the Town of Monroe appoints Lawrence H. Lezak to the Board of Ethics SLOT #7 with an expiration of 12/31/2023.

Motion by Supervisor -Tony Cardone second by Mary Bingham.

Final Resolution: Motion Carries

Aye: Supervisor -Tony Cardone Mike McGinn Mary Bingham Sal Scancarello

Action (Resolution) Discussion: 7.2 Carla McNamara Assessor's Clerk

2022-#578

BE IT RESOLVED that the Town Board of the Town of Monroe Made a Motion for the

approval of job classification status change for Carla McNamara Assessor's Clerk from full-time provisional to full-time permanent. Carla was hired provisionally in January 2022 pending the Civil Service Exam for this job title. As a result of the exam and canvassing results Carla qualifies for the permanent status appointment.

Motion by Supervisor -Tony Cardone second by Mary Bingham.

Final Resolution: Motion Carries

Aye: Supervisor -Tony Cardone Mike McGinn Mary Bingham Sal Scancarello

Action (Resolution): 7.3 2013 Dial-A-Bus for Surplus

To hear Town Highway Superintendent James Patterson RE 2013 Dial-A-Bus for Surplus please go on-line to Board doc's Video Clip #7.3 0:55:49.

2022-#579

BE IT RESOLVED that the Town Board of the Town of Monroe Made a Motion to surplus the following vehicle:

2013 Ford Dial-A-Bus

Plate #: BE6293

VIN #: 1FDFE4FS1DDA85453

Motion by Supervisor -Tony Cardone second by Mike McGinn.

Final Resolution: Motion Carries

Aye: Supervisor -Tony Cardone Mike McGinn Mary Bingham Sal Scancarello

Action (Resolution) Discussion: 7.4 DG Management/310 Schunnemunk Street Subdivision

To hear Board Members discussion RE DG Management/310 Schunnemunk Street Subdivision please go on-line to Board Doc's Video Clip #7.4 0:56:45.

2022-#580

BE IT RESOLVED that the Town Board of the Town of Monroe Made a Motion authorizing the Supervisor to sign the MS4 acceptance form for the DG Management subdivision application for the applicant to gain coverage under the NYSDEC Stormwater Permit. MHE to provide Task Order by December 52022 to do the survey of the roadway in a final form approved by Town Attorney.

Motion by Mike McGinn second by Sal Scancarello.

Final Resolution: Motion Carries

Aye: Supervisor -Tony Cardone Mike McGinn Mary Bingham Sal Scancarello

Action (Resolution) Discussion: 7.5 2023 Agreement for Engineering Services

To hear Board Members discussion RE 2023 Agreement for Engineering Services please go on-line to Board Doc's Video Clip #7.5 00:30.

2022-#581

BE IT RESOLVED that the Town Board of the Town of Monroe Made a Motion to accept the Agreement for Engineering Services with McGoey Hauser Edsall subject to approval in final form by our Town Attorney.

Motion by Mary Bingham second by Mike McGinn.

Final Resolution: Motion Carries

Aye: Supervisor -Tony Cardone Mike McGinn Mary Bingham Sal Scancarello

Action (Resolution) Discussion: 7.6 Additional Engineering Services Highway Garage Study

To hear Supervisor Cardone and Highway Superintendent James Patterson RE Additional Engineering Services Highway Garage Study please go on-line to Board Doc's Video Clip #7.6 1:02:07.

2022-#582

BE IT RESOLVED that the Town Board of the Town of Monroe Made a Motion authorizing additional engineering services related to the Town of Monroe Highway Department Garage study. This Authorization shall serve as a supplement to the executed Professional Services Agreement dated March 27 2020. Additional services are required which shall include an amendment to the existing study to reflect the recent discussions with Highway Superintendent Pat Patterson of modifications to the scope. Additional professional services are a lump sum fee of \$7500 plus reimbursable expenses and shall be billed monthly in accordance with the Standard Fee Schedule.

Motion by Mike McGinn second by Sal Scancarello.

Final Resolution: Motion Carries

Aye: Supervisor -Tony Cardone Mike McGinn Mary Bingham Sal Scancarello

Information: 7.7 Village DPW Supervisor Larry Dice

To hear Supervisor Cardone RE prayers for Village DPW Supervisor Larry Dice please go on-line to Board Doc's Video Clip #7.7 1:04:36.

Action (Resolution) Discussion: 7.8 Resolution to Handle Litigation

To hear Supervisor Cardone and Town Counsel Nugent RE Resolution to Handle Litigation please go on-line to Board Doc's Video Clip #7.8 1:05:19.

2022-#583

BE IT RESOLVED that the Town Board of the Town of Monroe Made the following Resolution

by Supervisor Cardone and seconded by Councilman McGinn:

RESOLUTION AUTHORIZING SPECIAL COUNSEL TO HANDLE LITIGATION

WHEREAS the Town Board ("Board") currently utilizes the legal services of the law firm of Feerick Nugent MacCartney PLLC ("Special Counsel"); and

WHEREAS the Assessor for the Town of Monroe Royce G. Noblin Jr. has been named as a party in a pending Declaratory Article 78 litigation entitled W.C. Lincoln Corp. v. Village of Monroe Zoning Board of Appeals et al. (the "Litigation") Index No. EF006416-2022; and

WHEREAS the Town Board desires to have Special Counsel undertake representation and a defense in such Litigation.

NOW THEREFORE it is resolved as follows:

Section 1. The above "WHEREAS" clauses are incorporated herein as if set forth in full.

Section 2. Special Counsel is authorized to appear and defend the Town's Assessor Royce G. Noblin Jr. in said Litigation and shall be compensated for all services performed for the Town with regard to said Litigation as set forth in the Town Board Resolution and Agreement appointing Special Counsel Feerick Nugent MacCartney PLLC. Same will be billed and paid by the Town in addition to any other legal services Special Counsel has previously been retained to represent for the Town.

Section 3. This Resolution shall be effective immediately.

The question of the adoption of the foregoing Resolution was duly put to a vote on roll call which resulted as follows:

Yea Nay Abstain Absent

Anthony Cardone Supervisor [X] [] [] []

Michael McGinn Councilperson [X] [] [] []

Mary Bingham Councilperson [X] [] [] []

Sal Scancarello Councilperson [X] [] [] []

Dorey Houle Councilperson [] [] [] [X]

The Resolution was thereupon duly adopted.

Motion by Supervisor -Tony Cardone second by Mike McGinn.

Final Resolution: Motion Carries

Aye: Supervisor -Tony Cardone Mike McGinn Mary Bingham Sal Scancarello

Information: 7.9 Highway Update by James Patterson Highway Superintendent

To hear Highway Update by James Patterson Highway Superintendent please go on-line to Board Doc's Video Clip #7.9 1:08:01.

8. Old Business

Discussion Information: 8.1 Update RE: Rye Hill Preserve

To hear Councilman McGinn RE update on Rye Hill Preserve please go on-line to Board Doc's Video Clip #1:11:17.

9. Public Comment

Information: 9.1 Rules for Public Comment

Discussion Information: 9.2 Public Comment

The following spoke during Public Comment. To hear their comments and Town Board members responses please go on-line to Board Doc's Video Clip #8.2 1:12:30.

- Denise Lasky (previously signed up to speak but not present at meeting)
- Matt Ladka
- Carol Hawxhurst
- Maureen Richardson
- Stephen Gornstein

10. Possible motion to adjourn to Executive and or/ Attorney Client Session

Information: 10.1 Enter into Executive Session

****NO ACTION AT THIS TIME**

11. Return to Regular Meeting

Information: 11.1 Return to Regular Meeting

****NO ACTION AT THIS TIME**

12. Adjournment

Action (Resolution): 12.1 Adjournment of Meeting

2022-#584

BE IT RESOLVED that the Town Board of the Town of Monroe adjourns the meeting of November 212022 at 8:45 PM.

Motion by Supervisor -Tony Cardone second by Sal Scancarello.

Final Resolution: Motion Carries

Aye: Supervisor -Tony Cardone Mike McGinn Mary Bingham Sal Scancarello

"